

## Historical Literature Review/Philosophical Discussion

### **Revisiting Survival 37 Years Later. Is the Data Still Compelling?<sup>1</sup>**

*by Professor Vernon M. Neppe, MD, PhD (Med), FRSSAf, DFAPA, BN&NP (UCNS), DSPE*

*Director, Pacific Neuropsychiatric Institute, Seattle, WA.*

*Author's Preface, June 2010: This article was published in 1973 when I was a final year medical student. It was submitted in fulfillment of an essay requirement by the Department of Psychiatry at the University of the Witwatersrand, in Johannesburg, South Africa. It won a prize, and, fortuitously, without my consent ended up being published by the medical school journal, "The Leech": I wrote it for my Professor, the esteemed Psychiatric Geneticist, the late Lewis Hurst, MD, DSc, who was a former President of the South African Society for Psychical Research, Prof. Hurst, in kindness, arranged for its publication, but without my knowledge.<sup>2</sup>*

*Ironically, this launched me into a publication I would probably never have willingly submitted because at the time it expressed a perspective different from the usual scientific article. Subsequently, this paper has traveled round the world because of its immense relevance.*

*When I read the article today, I note the focus on books without many journal articles. However, the later part of the article provides the most compelling discussion: the Rosemary Records, the Cross Correspondences and the musical compositions of Rosemary Brown still remain remarkable sources of evidence for human survival after bodily death.*

*I would change some of the ESP citations and certainly not mention Soal.<sup>3</sup> I would mention inter alia, the solid scientific work demonstrating psi including remote viewing,<sup>4</sup> Ganzfeld,<sup>5</sup> and possibly the Global Consciousness Project (GCP)<sup>6</sup> and the value of random number generators (RNG),<sup>6</sup> I would discuss in some detail the factors linked with psi such as experimenter effects, sheep-goat attitudes, the remarkable heuristic value of subjective paranormal experience in both spontaneous and experimental psi.<sup>7</sup> the value of neuroscience analyses including presentiment and neurophysiological studies,<sup>8</sup> plus the heuristic perspective of analyzing data based on detailed phenomenological perspectives as exemplified in my déjà vu<sup>9</sup> and also temporal lobe research.<sup>10</sup>*

*In the context of survival data, I still support my comments of 37 years ago. But I would add to this the profoundly important work on near death experiences (NDEs),<sup>11</sup> electronic voice phenomena (EVP) (or the almost synonymous "instrumental transcommunication" [ITC]),<sup>12</sup> and with respect, using computerized analyses of chess games as in my recent "Maroczy-Korchnoi" chess game report, which some are citing as amongst the strongest evidence for survival given the extended time demonstration of skills combined with*

*outstanding extremely difficult to research but nevertheless demonstrated data.<sup>13</sup> I would also reach into the later pool of reincarnation research though I regard the data in this area currently as powerful but less compelling.*

*I would also apply the model of Archetypal Synchronistic Resonance (ASR) as an alternative to Superpsi to argue against survival.<sup>14</sup> But, in my opinion, the data cited in this paper are not explained via ASR alone.*

*And I would, of course, update terminology, such as astral projection to out-of-body experience or poltergeist phenomena to recurrent spontaneous psychokinesis. I would update terminology such as telepathy and psychokinesis to terminological models, which I feel are more appropriately descriptive. But, for this article, I have kept every word and every phrase identical other than linguistic or editing aspects.*

*I would today not use the phrase “human personality survives” but “some component of the human consciousness, individual or collective, survives.”*

*I have fought with my integrity, knowing this is far the most radical paper I have ever written. As a relatively conservative scientist, I had to resolve whether I would be prepared to allow such a paper to be republished on the Internet for the world to see. But it was so extremely important, and there were so many earnest appeals, that I have surrendered to the demands of my colleagues and contacts.*

*Here is the article, identical to the original, other than rare typographical or grammatical editorial corrections plus updating any incomplete references. It remains in English (not Americanese). I have added an abstract and modified the overall title.*

[1] © Vernon M. Neppe 2010.

2 Hurst subsequently supervised Neppe’s Master of Medicine thesis on “Subjective Paranormal Experience and Temporal Lobe Symptomatology” (1977) and his Doctor of Philosophy thesis on “A Study of Déjà vu Experience” (1981) at the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa.

3 Soal was unfortunately involved in a scandal leading to his data being questioned.

4 See more on Remote Viewing at e.g., <http://www.irva.org>

5 For an overall perspective on Ganzfeld and other areas: Radin, D. (2006) *Entangled Minds*. New York: Paraview.

6 See for both GCP and RNG e.g., Nelson, R. (2009) The Global Consciousness Project: Meaningful Correlations in Random Data. <http://noosphere.princeton.edu/>

7 Subjective paranormal experience and phenomenology: See Neppe, V. M. (1990) “Subjective Paranormal Experiences : A Decade Later.” *Exceptional Human Experience*, 8, 37-39; and Neppe, V. M. (2009) “Phenomenological Anomalistic Psychology: Ensuring Homogeneous Data Collection for Present and Future Research on Possible Psi Phenomena by Detailing Subjective Descriptions, Using the Multi-Axial a to Z SEATTLE Classification.” Proceedings, PA Convention, Seattle, WA, USA.

8 Neurophysiology: See Neppe, V. M. (2008). Re-Examining Current Neuroscience Research Controversies. *Australian J of Parapsychology*, 8, 128-156.

9 Déjà vu: See [www.brainvoyage.com/deja](http://www.brainvoyage.com/deja): Specifically the trilogy of déjà vu books.

Neppe, V. M. (2006) *Déjà Vu Revisited*. Seattle, WA: Brainvoyage.com

Neppe, V. M. (2006) *Déjà Vu: Glossary and Library*. Seattle: Brainvoyage.com

Neppe, V. M., & Funkhouser, A. T. (Eds.). (2006) *Déjà Vu: A Second Look*. Seattle, WA, USA: Brainvoyage.com

10 Temporal lobe: See e.g. Neppe, V. M. (1983) "Temporal Lobe Symptomatology in Subjective Paranormal Experiences. *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research*, 77, 1-29 and Palmer, J., & Neppe, V. M. (2003) "A Controlled Analysis of Subjective Paranormal Experiences in Temporal Lobe Dysfunction in a Neuropsychiatric Population." *Journal of Parapsychology*, 67, 75-98.

11 For more on NDEs : <http://www.nderf.org/>

12 For more on EVP and ITC: see: <http://www.worlditc.org/>

13 NEPPE, V. M. (2007) "A Detailed Analysis of an Important Chess Game: Revisiting 'Maróczy Versus Korchnoi'." *Journal Soc. Psychical Research*, 71, 129-147

14 Mishlove, J., & Engen, B. C. (2007) "Archetypal Synchronistic Resonance." *J. Humanistic Psychology*, 47, 223-242.

15 This paper was first published in 1973: Neppe, VM (1973) "Aspects of psychical phenomena, with especial emphasis on the alleged scientific evidence for the survival of the human personality after bodily death: a preliminary survey." *The Leech*,; 43:27-35.

## **Aspects Of Psychical Phenomena, With Especial Emphasis On The Alleged Scientific Evidence For The Survival Of The Human Personality After Bodily Death: A Preliminary Survey.<sup>15</sup>**

*Abstract: Evidence for the survival of the human personality after bodily death is discussed at three levels:*

*1. At the physical level of the psychic sensitive: specifically the neurophysiological bases, like electroencephalography.*

*2. At the level of the manifestations of the psychic sensitives: this includes for example: independent direct voice communication, out of body experience, recurrent spontaneous psychokinesis, automatic handwriting, ectoplasmic materializations, psychic healing including psychic surgery, absence healing, paintings of the "other side" done in trance, and psychometry.*

*3. At the level of content of communications: These include the Rosemary Records, the Cross Correspondences and the musical compositions of Rosemary Brown.*

*Specific examples and as such the refutation of any specific example does not disprove anything but the specific example.*

*The following conclusions may be drawn from the data presented:*

- 1. that death as an extinction is an illusory concept;*
- 2. that individual human entities survive physical death;*
- 3. that these individuals retain at least some knowledge of their physical experiences;*
- 4. that these individuals can continue to learn after physical death;*
- 5. that laws are apparent which contradict or which occur outside the range of our physical laws of space, time and even mass;*
- 6. that the "dead" have communicated with the living.*
- 7. If one further applies the premise that if the basic pattern of human fate is the same, and that if one person survives bodily death, everyone does, the conclusion is apparently almost inescapable that some component of human consciousness survives bodily death.*

### **Introduction**

It is with the full realization of my own inadequacies, that I embark on a subject which I believe to be of the utmost importance, both philosophically and in possible practical application, of which so much and yet so little is known, so much in terms of the vast body of evidence that has accumulated, and so little in terms of its ability to withstand critical analysis. I refer to that subject so long a metaphysical concept and a religious exercise, and now a science, called parapsychology. Two human obstacles immediately present themselves: the prejudice of the scientific population as a group, and the fraudulence of many of the experimental subjects. The former was well illustrated by the clinical psychologist who was quoted as saying (11): "If there were a tenth the evidence for any other subject as there is for telepathy I would accept it immediately, but even if there were ten times more evidence for telepathy I could never accept it." Similarly, Hans Reichenbach, mathematician and logician, on hearing of the apparently overwhelming evidence for ESP explained his fears, "If that's true it is terrible, terrible. It would mean that I would have to scrap everything and start from the beginning." Arthur Koestler summarized the situation: "Innovation is a two-fold threat to academic mediocrities: it endangers their oracular authority; and it evokes the deeper fear that their whole laboriously constructed intellectual edifice may collapse." (31) "Moreover, in terms of the empirical 'physicalistic presupposition' involving the notion that all knowledge has its basis in what is physically perceived, and only physically, it is of course, deceit and illusion to speak of knowledge based on non-physical perception and therefore, it follows that parapsychology is dealing with deceit and illusion." (66) "There is however, no theoretical backing for the 'physicalistic' presupposition and certainly it has no truly empirical support."

The former was well illustrated by the clinical psychologist who was quoted as saying (11): "If there were a tenth the evidence for any other subject as there is for telepathy I would accept it immediately, but even if there were ten times more evidence for telepathy I could never accept it." Similarly, Hans Reichenbach, mathematician and logician, on hearing of the apparently overwhelming evidence for ESP explained his fears, "If that's true it is terrible, terrible. It would mean that I would have to scrap everything and start from the beginning."

Arthur Koestler summarized the situation: “Innovation is a two-fold threat to academic mediocrities: it endangers their oracular authority; and it evokes the deeper fear that their whole laboriously constructed intellectual edifice may collapse.” (31) “Moreover, in terms of the empirical ‘physicalistic presupposition’ involving the notion that all knowledge has its basis in what is physically perceived, and only physically, it is of course, deceit and illusion to speak of knowledge based on non-physical perception and therefore, it follows that parapsychology is dealing with deceit and illusion.” (66) “There is however, no theoretical backing for the ‘physicalistic’ presupposition and certainly it has no truly empirical support.”

Even though I shall attempt in this essay to discuss nonphysical perception and experience through the screen of physical evidence and in so doing attempt to marshal evidence for nonphysical perception in a negative way (in the sense that findings must make contact with physically verifiable evidence, if results are to be meaningful to conventional scientists) (65) I shall also include spontaneous phenomena, and on all, I shall, of course, use the basic methods of scientific reasoning (30). It seems to me that there are three levels at which parapsychological phenomena, and more specifically the evidence for the survival of the human personality after bodily death, can be discussed:

1. At the physical level of the psychic sensitive: the most definitive method, at present, in this category is the EEG changes.
2. At the level of the manifestations of the psychic sensitives: this includes for example: independent direct voice communication, astral projection, poltergeist phenomena, automatic handwriting, telekinesis, ectoplasmic materializations, psychic healing including psychic surgery and absence healing, paintings of the “other side” done in trance, and psychometry.
3. At the level of content of communications: these will be limited to specific examples and as such it must be emphasized that the refutation of any specific example does not disprove anything but the specific example.

### **The Physical Level of Psychic Sensitives**

#### **Electroencephalograms of Mediums**

In a philosophical hypothesis on the neurophysiological implications of parapsychology, A.C. Mundy-Castle (60, 61) suggested the concept of a timeless, spaceless universe in which all things or events exist but in a latent or unmanifest sense. Drug such as LSD probably free the cerebral cortex from the modulating effect of the brain stem reticular activating system allowing the cortex to “free wheel.” Thus the peculiar experiences consequent on the taking of such drugs may simply be due to a new mode of integration of experience (60, 61, 67).

An alternative possibility exists: namely, that under such circumstances the individual is exposed to a purely mental universe, independent of matter, containing all mental events, which may in some way overlap or be interlinked with the ordinary physical four-dimensional universe (61). Certain people, regarded as psychic, mediumistic, clairvoyant etc, may be able to establish or maintain contact with or without the aid of special techniques.

The scientific investigation of parapsychological phenomena from the point of view of brain function may imply an attempt to test the validity of these experiences (63). In a study of twelve subjects, ten women and two men, ranging in age between 18 and 66 years, and consisting of eleven mediums and an “automatic writer” (all of whom volunteered through the agency of the South African Society for Psychical Research), G.K. Nelson adopted the

following procedure: routine EEG examinations were carried out, usually with the subject in a separate room from the recording equipment. Photic stimulation was the only activating procedure applied in all cases. Six cases went into a trance after an initial few minutes of EEG monitoring (61, 62, 63).

In the resting EEG recordings, ten out of the twelve cases showed localized signs of temporal lobe instability. The young automatic writer showed a partial suppression of alpha rhythms on the left side. Asymmetries and or asynchronies of EEG activity were therefore present in 11 of the 12 subjects almost equally divided between the dominant and non-dominant hemispheres as far as the site of maximum effect was concerned. (Interhemispheric differences in amplitude of the alpha rhythm are by no means uncommon; indeed the alpha amplitude often tends to be lower in the dominant hemisphere. It is only when the amplitude in one hemisphere is less than half that in the other that one takes particular note of such a difference — the EEG of the automatic writer showed such a difference, 61).

EEG abnormalities of the kind often found in the interictal EEGs of patients with epilepsy were seen in five cases in the form of paroxysmal bursts or focal spikes and sharp waves. Three other cases showed occasional sharp waves, raising the possibility of cortical hyperexcitability. Only four cases had EEGs of the kind usually associated with epilepsy and there were no reports of fits in the histories of any of the twelve volunteers (16, 31). For these reasons the possibility exists that if the EEG signs are valid indices of temporal lobe dysfunction this is of a non-epileptic kind (62).

If we assume that these EEG findings are not an artifact of the very small sample it is necessary to consider whether the majority of these electrical events are suggestive of temporal lobe dysfunction. Functional instability of the temporal lobe is often associated with the most bizarre of all epileptic phenomena, and such complex forms of abnormal behavior as automatism. There is also ample evidence that temporal lobe abnormalities can be accompanied by a variety of unusual forms of behavior without any clinical evidence of epilepsy (63). (For example, temporal lobe dysfunction was a characteristic of 40 per cent of patients with a combination of depersonalization and phobic anxiety.)

Possible, but unlikely, etiological factors in the development of dysfunction in this sample include the effects of malnutrition on electro-cerebral maturation, and disease (63). It has been suggested that the temporal lobe is peculiarly susceptible to the effects of trauma (62). (In this respect it is interesting to note that, there is, as far as I am aware, only one case of traumatically induced psychic abilities, that being the case of Peter Hurkos, whom some consider the greatest exponent of ESP of our time, 26.) The possibility of a genetic transmission of such electrical brain wave patterns (as suggested by Nelson, 64) should also be considered.

It seems possible that what appears as electrical evidence of temporal lobe dysfunction in mediums, as compared with the general population might be a reflection of a sort of brain function that is a prerequisite for this form of behavior. The EEG findings in the trance state in the seven cases involved in the above study remains unanswered because of the inconsistency of the EEG changes with other descriptions of EEG activity during trance states (such as those described by Kasamatsu and Hirai in 1969, Chari in 1970, and Stanford and Lovin, in 1970) and in ESP situations (63).

The possibility of the focal temporal lobe EEG changes being merely one form of inter-hemispheric asynchrony or asymmetry is also possible. These changes could be explained by the mathematical view of the brain of Professor Griffith (22) (and on the observations of Sperry in 1968 on split-brain preparations) that partial interruption of the

connections between the two cerebral hemispheres could give rise to the subjective impression to the owner of such a brain that he would occasionally seem to have an alien self inhabiting his head as well as his normal self.

It is important to stress that the validity of mediumistic experience is neither confirmed nor denied by the presence of an unusual anatomical or physiological characteristic in the brain. The above findings do, however, show that parapsychological phenomena are at least partly a function of the brain, and could serve to strengthen the hypothesis that certain people by reason of their individual pattern of brain function may be in a position more readily to experience a mental universe which is independent of matter (61).

## **Manifestations of the Psychically Sensitive and**

### **Content of Communications or Phenomena:**

#### **Introduction**

Paranormal cases involve as essential features something conflicting with some part or other of the accepted general scheme of how nature is constituted and how it works (9). According to Professor C.D. Broad, Knightsbridge, a paranormal case involves either or both of:

1. a coincidence or set of coincidences so odd that it is hard to believe that it can be merely contingent; or
2. requiring a causal explanation of a certain very peculiar kind.

As to the former alternative, the larger the number of well attested cases of the kind and the more features that are common and peculiar to them, the less likely it becomes that all of them should be mere chance coincidences. As to the latter, the causal explanation must conflict with the accepted general scheme as opposed to only conflicting with particular laws and particular concatenations of things and or events (9).

Many apparently evidential phenomena relating to the survival of the human personality after bodily death can be explained away by various forms of extrasensory perception including telepathy, precognition, retrocognition, and psychometry. As a very great body of evidence can be eliminated by these means, and as such, these evidential cases are not dealt with further, it is necessary to discuss, very briefly, the nature of and evidence for the above four types of phenomena (telepathy, precognition, retrocognition, and psychometry). Other phenomena such as clairvoyance (seeing beyond the physical; 25a, 36, 41) and clairaudience (hearing beyond the physical; 45) are too subjective to be scientifically investigated and can be attributed, in any event to either hallucinations, delusions, telepathy or precognition. In addition, it should be noted that even if their existence were proven their existence can be explained away by the presence of a "thought-form" (e.g. by retrocognition) being present and in no way does this prove the active survival of the human personality after bodily death, although it may be taken as statistically contributory.

#### **Telepathy (49,26,8,50,42,46,47,48,Ei2,12,30,24)**

Telepathy may be defined as the supposed communication of one mind with another by other than normal sensory means. The scientific evidence for telepathy is equivocal, there being apparently no confirmatory evidence for telepathy under experimental conditions. This is because most every scientific experiment on telepathy which has achieved odds so overwhelming that it can only be considered scientifically proven, has been explained away by alternative explanations by critics not the least of whom is C.E.M. Hansel, Professor of

## Psychology at the University of Wales.

The following examples of telepathic experiments which have achieved overwhelming odds but which can possibly be attributed to fraud are presented, together with the possible explanation:

1. Sara Ownbey (sender) — George Zirkle, 1938, — Fixed time intervals between communications postulated.
2. Rhine—Linzmayr (receiver), 1931. Durham—Cheating by peeping not ruled out.
3. Pratt—Pearce (receiver), 1933. Pearce may have looked through a window.
4. Glyn and Leuan Jones, 1955—Possible communication by means of a supersonic dog whistle.
5. Rhine'—Miss Riess, 1937. Miss Riess is alleged to have disappeared after these experiments.
6. Soal—Shackleton. 1941. Precautions not rigorous enough.
7. Soal—Stewart, 1945. Precautions not rigorous enough.
8. Mrs. A. Toynbee— Professor Gilbert Murray (receiver), 1910-1915, scored 33 per cent; 1916-1924 scored 36 per cent success, 23 per cent partial success. Fraud not completely ruled out.
9. Dr J.B. Rhine—Miss Turner—Average scores close up but overwhelming odds on over 250 miles. Fraud not ruled out.
10. Sir Hubert Wilkins (Arctic) — Harold Sherman (New York) receiver), 1937-1938. 68 successful telepathic messages only 3 successful radio messages—apparently evidential.
11. Rhine—Dr. Carlo Marchesi. 500 to 1 odds received over 4000 miles— Odds not great enough.
12. Peter Hurkos—Henry Stone (receiver). Odds of 1 in 10 to the power 26 over large number of tests under Dr. Andrija Puharich, Round Table Foundation, Mayne, U.S.A. — no further details are available to me.

Other, explanations of the above results involves debates about the ESP cards themselves and therefore excludes nos. 8 and 10, at least. For example, methods of shuffling, and the type of card (conscious or subconscious recognition). Unconscious clues, favourable recording errors, displacement effects and the publicizing of positive results have also been postulated as interfering with results.

As spontaneous phenomena, however, there are thousands of authenticated cases, which can be attributed to telepathy that tends by its very nature to be spontaneous. (The EEGs of people undergoing scientific telepathic experiments, using Zener cards resemble those of normal people during a state of cerebral attention, 61, 63). This is perhaps just the worst state for telepathic receiving of communications!

Telepathy is an important alternative explanation to much of the evidence for human survival of bodily death. Very often this involves even hypothesizing a form of distant (over thousands of miles) telepathic delving into the unconscious minds of others, which is moreover at will (i.e., a planned act). As such, it sometimes appears that the hypothesized

explanation is even more improbable than “spirit” communication. One further point should be clarified. If scientific proof of human survival of bodily death and communication between the dead and the living were available, it would mean, ipso facto, that telepathy were scientifically proven, because the method of communication is, by definition, telepathic.

### **Psychometry (26,43,37,2)**

Psychometry is defined as divination of facts from an object. It is a phenomenon not unlike telepathy in that its content of messages tends to be spontaneous and it is as such difficult to investigate using inflexible scientific methods. Moreover, many of its phenomena can be just as easily, or far more easily explained away by phenomena such as telepathy, clairvoyance and clairaudience. Under these circumstances, the differentiation appears to be entirely academic.

The significance of psychometry lies as an alternative explanation to the survival of the human personality after bodily death. For example; there are several cases of psychics finding the drowned bodies of people whom nobody living could locate by physical means (26). (These people must have died accidental deaths for these arguments to be necessary.) This can be explained away psychometrically by “thought-forms” being left. This explanation is borne out by psychometrists such as Peter Hurkos and Evelyn Penrose who claim to be able to locate inanimate objects such as mineral deposits.

### **Precognition and Retrocognition (14,8,15,26,28,39, 46,47,42,49,50)**

Precognition is defined as knowledge of a future event obtained by paranormal means. Retrocognition, conversely, is knowledge, of a past event obtained by paranormal means. Precognition (11,14,59), like telepathy, tends to be a spontaneous phenomenon. However, these phenomena can come under scientific scrutiny if they meet the following criteria (the term “dream” is here used to refer to the precognitive message, and not in its literal sense (56,38).

1. The dream should be reported to a credible witness before the occurrence of the event to which it appears to relate.
2. The time interval between the “dream” and the event should be short.
3. The event should be one, which, in the circumstances of the dreamer, seemed extremely improbable at the time of the “dream.”
4. The description in the “dream” should be of an event destined to be literally fulfilled and not merely symbolically foreshadowed.
5. Details of the dream should tally with details of the event.

Using these criteria, there are several (possibly thousands of) well-authenticated cases of precognition documented. One example will suffice: the Aberfan disaster in Wales on the 21st October, 1966, in which 144 people (128 children and 16 adults) were killed). It was investigated after the event By Dr. J.C. Barker (32) for any possible precognitive “dreams.” Of the 76 letters received, 60 required further investigation, and of these, 22 contained confirmation from witnesses, of these 3 reports were described as “very evidential.” In addition 7 of the percipients (four men and three women) developed nonspecific symptoms of acute mental and physical unease from four days to a few hours before the Aberfan disaster. Dr. Barker termed this constellation of symptoms the “Predisaster Syndrome,” which he claims has never before been reported in the literature. Many psychical phenomena alleged to have been obtained from communication with the dead can be simply ascribed to

precognition.

It is almost impossible to prove the existence of retrocognition (25) because the past has occurred physically already. However, retrocognition is a useful explanation for such phenomena as several people at different times watching the apparent reenactment of a murder, which had occurred several years before. (There are several reports of cases such as these.) In such instances one can propose that a “thoughtform” may somehow pass through the barriers of time.

### **The Psychically Sensitive**

The most evidential groups of phenomena falling under this heading are mediumship, more specifically independent direct voice mediumship, psychic healing, astral projection, and psychic photography. These shall be discussed in further detail later. Other phenomena shall be briefly dealt with now.

#### **Automatic Writing**

The most scientific manner (excluding actual content of messages) in which automatic writing can serve to illustrate possible human survival of bodily death is in the actual handwriting specimen. To my knowledge, there are no well-authenticated claims from reputable sources, which cannot be ascribed to fraud in this regard. Psychiatric imbalance, inconclusive evidence or fraud are the most logical explanations for claims of having drawn paintings of the 'other side', or of the dead, during trance, or of detecting the fingerprints of the dead.

#### **Alleged Poltergeist Phenomena (3,21~23,32,33,44)**

These have almost always been associated with the presence of a child of pubertal age. This fact has given rise to at least two possible explanations other than that of a “ghostly presence”: childish pranks or fraud and the possible uncontrolled harnessing of “psychic power,” which has been postulated to be at its maximum at about puberty. This hypothesis can also explain away most of the cases of telekinesis, the most likely explanation for the remainder again being fraud (this being especially so during spiritualist séances).

#### **Ectoplasmic Materialization (5,6,32,33)**

As far as I know, there are no well authenticated, scientifically well-investigated cases of ectoplasmic materialization during trance, nor is there any evidence for apports being delivered from the “dead”; such phenomena have, often, however been claimed. Ouija boards or their equivalents have been a popular type of “séance” among the public for a long time. As far as I am aware, there is no evidence contradicting the hypothesis that those who take part consciously or subconsciously move the marker (e.g., a glass). Those veridical facts, which have come to light using this technique, can be explained by a form of subconscious, distant telepathy or simple precognition.

#### **Reincarnation**

The evidence for reincarnation is equivocal. Many of the alleged claims have been found to be fraudulent; still others can again be attributed to a form of distant, subconscious telepathy.

Even then, there are still several cases, which require further investigation and I feel that the question of its possible existence must be left open. T.C. Lethbridge (34,35) has described experiments using a pendulum, which he claims proves the existence of life after death. I am not qualified to even comment on his experiments. But even if his results were proven, these experiments would at most serve only to add evidence for the existence of extrasensory phenomena.

### **Mediumship (1,5,6,21,20)**

Mediumship may be defined as state of receptiveness induced in certain people at certain times while their consciousness remains either normal, reduced, or in rare cases, eliminated, leading to the superimposition of knowledge outside the medium's mind, and capable of finding expression in clairvoyance, speech or writing (11).

Most mediumistic phenomena are produced in such a way that they can easily be ascribed to either fraud, mass hallucination, or delusion. An exception to this is alleged communication from the dead via the independent direct voice method of mediumship. In this rare, allegedly very advanced form of mediumship, voices are produced independently of the medium's vocal organs, the sound usually arising just to the side or just above the medium. I shall confine myself to discussing this method, or more specifically to the 60-year-old British medium, Leslie Flint, who is possibly the most tested medium Britain has ever produced, and who has been tested in both Britain and America.

Mr. Flint claims to have “thousands of different voices of discarnate persons” that have been tape recorded for posterity, speaking in different dialects, in foreign languages unknown to me and even in languages no longer spoken on this Earth. These recordings include gramophone records of “spirit voices,” one of which was made during a demonstration at Denison House, London, SW1, in response to a theory by a psychical researcher who postulated that the voices were auditory hallucinations brought about by the hypnotic power of the medium and the subconscious longing of the sitters (21). Several tests have been conducted to show that Flint does not produce the voices. Three examples will suffice.

Dr. Louis Young, who had previously worked with Thomas Alva Edison in devising tricks and illusions for Maskelyne and Devant in their psychical researches in America, roped Flint to a chair and put into a measured glass enough colored water for him to hold in his mouth for the duration of the séance. Twenty minutes later after voices had communicated, the amount of water was found to be only fractionally less. In a series of tests, at various premises including the British Society for Psychical Research, and before numerous researchers including the Rev. Drayton Thomas, Brigadier R.C. Firebrace C.B.E., and Father Arthur Sharp, voices spoke under the following conditions:

1. Flint's lips were sealed with plaster.
2. A throat microphone was wired to amplifiers to magnify the slightest sound made by his larynx (an electronics expert watched the instruments)
3. An infrared telescope was focused on Flint to watch his every movement in the dark
4. Flint's hands were held by sitters on either side of him.
5. Experiments at Sydney Grove, Flint's séance room, on 7th May 1948, before Dr. D.J. West, the then Research Officer of the SPR and 4 others using stringent precautions, again produced voices.
6. However, at the end of the test one of the plasters sealing Flint's lips was no longer in line with an indelible pencil marking and this slightly detracts from the value of the

experiment.

Leslie Flint has been accused of being a super-ventriloquist-cum-mimic. However, ventriloquists require dummies or puppets elsewhere and work in the light. Moreover, his alleged mimicry would have to extend to thousands of voices recognized by people on Earth as those they knew, he would need to be able to speak with many voices all at once (as there are sometimes several communicators simultaneously), and he would have to be able to produce voices from his stomach (e.g., as would be required in experiments 2. or 3.) although even this would not help in conditions such as 1., which are required to sound like his Cockney boy control, "Mickey." I think these possibilities can be safely discounted.

Mr. Flint has been accused of using prerecorded tapes to produce his voices. It is difficult to see how these can hold two-way conversations with sitters. It has also been suggested that Mr. Flint may use live accomplices to provide a two-way voice channel. Professor William R. Bennett of Columbia University, New York, discounted this possibility when he said: "In an impromptu séance in my apartment the same voices not only appeared but took part in conversation with the guests. The logistics of transporting a concealed company of performers for this purpose appear to be too formidable for serious consideration." It is difficult to find an alternative explanation to Mr. Flint's alleged ability to communicate with the discarnate.

### **Psychic Healing (4,13,16,17,18,19,27,29,57)**

By psychic healing is meant healing by paranormal means. Most cases of psychic healing are allegedly through dead spirits working via mediums who claim to have the gift of healing.

Brian Inglis (29) has pointed out that whether individual cures are normal or supernormal is not susceptible of proof. He suggests that even if a new limb were to grow as a consequence of a healer's ministrations, the medical profession could attribute this to "a genetic freak, whereby the individual concerned had benefited from the earlier evolutionary process that enables lizards to grow new tail." In a similar way any allegedly supernormal cures can be attributed to misdiagnosis, spontaneous remission, functional disease, hysteria, temporary remission, and even the 'X-rays must have been mixed up. I am sure that these are the explanations for many of the allegedly supernormal cures. Thus individual cases are not of much clinical value in isolation.

They become of far more value when considered collectively. Thus, probably the most famous of all "spirit" healers, Harry Edwards, working at his healing sanctuary at Burrows Lea, Shere, Guildford, Surrey, claims to have healed tens of thousands of people, both by "contact" healing and "absence" healing, since he first discovered his gift in 1935. Indeed, he claims that over 80 per cent of patients indicate improvement, and over 30 per cent report complete recoveries; moreover, the 20 per cent of failures have invariably passed over devoid of stress (he claims). He points out that in 1966, his sanctuary received a million letters, and claims that not only do 5,000 visit his healing sanctuary for healing per year, but that many doctors request healing. (For example, in 1959, he allegedly had over 1000 requests for healing from doctors.) By 1963, there were more than 2,000 practicing spirit healers in Britain.

Hutton (27,28) has followed up 153 of the cases of George Chapman of Aylesbury, Britain, of alleged cure by psychic surgery. (Supposedly Dr. William Lang, a nineteenth century surgeon, works through Chapman's hands and performs "spirit surgery.") All these cases have remitted. What is more, Edward Townley Bailey, MB, BS, FRCS (Eng), a consultant Orthopedic Surgeon, agrees with him.

Medical Orthodoxy, as a body, have however, generally displayed a lack of interest in the possible existence of paranormal healing possibly because collaboration with unregistered practitioners is forbidden. Nevertheless, the British Medical Association (B.M.A.) did help investigate the whole subject of healing in what has come to be known as “the Archbishop's Commission,” which constituted a committee of inquiry into the claims of Spiritualism to communicate with the dead. This committee was established in 1953 and reached a majority verdict (for long this result was suppressed) that these claims were true (21). The B.M.A., however, reporting in 1958, stated that they had “seen no evidence that there is any special type of illness cured solely by spiritual healing which cannot be cured by medical methods which do not involve such claims.” (18,29,57) They did concede, “through spirit healing, recoveries take place that cannot be explained by medical science.” The evidence for the existence of psychic healing is, therefore, equivocal.

It must be emphasized, however, that even if the existence of paranormal cures were scientifically proven, this would not prove that the mechanism of this healing is through the dead, and this would consequently not prove claims that the human personality survives physical death.

### **Astral Projection** (5,6,25,32,33,49,50,58,54,68)

Astral projection refers to experiences by living people, which take place outside their physical body while they are in their astral (spiritual, nonphysical) body at once.

There have been possibly thousands of reports of alleged astral projection. Some events taking place while physically in deep coma due to brain injury, drugs or anesthesia have been described, although astral projection under these circumstances usually appears to abolish the ability to recall astral memories. Astral projection either during sleep, voluntarily, during an illness, or shock is often associated with people remembering their astral experiences. Often they claim to have “traveled elsewhere” and can describe what someone else was doing and this is authenticated. Indeed there are occasional cases of people being seen in two places at once, their astral form being seen clairvoyantly (49), very rarely even being photographed (32).

Astral projection can however be attributed to telepathy (distant, subconscious telepathy, if necessary), or clairvoyance, and the few instances outstanding can be explained away either by hallucinations, delusions or plain fraud. Thus astral projection must be considered to be only statistically contributory to evidence for the survival of the human personality after bodily death.

### **Psychic Photography** (6,32)

Evidence that makes the hypothesis of survival of bodily death almost scientifically indisputable is the occurrence under test conditions of photographic evidence of the dead.

Probably the most well known evidence in this regard is that produced under the supervision of the late Dr. Glen Hamilton of Winnipeg, Canada. Hamilton, a surgeon, held many public offices including that of elder of his church for 28 years. From 1919 onwards, Hamilton and other psychic researchers performed experiments in a special Psychic Research room, using three mediums, of whom Mrs. Poole and Mrs. Marshall were the main people concerned with the alleged production of ectoplasm (usually the latter). Their purpose was to obtain facts and to photograph any phenomena that could be so recorded.

The séance room was simply furnished. It included a bell box out of reach of anyone) in which a bell would ring if any pressure was exerted on it. There was also an electrically

operated gramophone, and 14 cameras of various types focused on a central point on the back wall of the medium's cabinet. These cameras were electrically operated by a pushbutton panel held in Hamilton's left hand. A series of exposures could be made when necessary. After a séance all present signed the report in the presence of a Notary Public. The development of the pictures took place in a special dark room under the supervision of a special group. The mediums were nonprofessional and were searched by lady sitter before a séance and sponged, while during a séance their hands were held so as to have full control of them.

Under these conditions, besides the alleged production of raps, bell ringing, levitation and production of ectoplasm from the mediums' orifices, the scientists were instructed when to fire the cameras (flash photographs) by the "spirit control" speaking through the medium. The photographs of people who were dead, including Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, appeared, the face enveloped in what appears to be ectoplasm. British statesman, W.E. Gladstone, was also photographed, and included in this photo is a necklace around the medium's neck, which was allegedly (according to the witnesses) not worn by her but claimed to be an apport. Dr. Glen Hamilton himself was photographed under test conditions in his own laboratory in a sheet of ectoplasm in 1944 i.e., nine years after his death. Other photographs produced in a séance other than Hamilton's group are also available. The "beautiful Katie King" was photographed in 1873 by Sir William Crookes. She was medically examined by a Dr. Cully during her "ectoplasmic materialization" and she was also photographed by Hamilton's group. Major Patterson has published a book on another class of spirit photography, involving ordinary daylight snapshots of people, which on developing include an extra face, usually of a dead relative or friend. (For this to occur, the photographer or one of the sitters is supposedly required to be mediumistic.) Patterson's series of photographs have been carefully examined by experts, even at Scotland Yard, without finding evidence of fraud. John Myers of New York, besides producing many other psychic photographs under test conditions, has produced a picture of Edgar Wallace surrounded by "ectoplasm" about which Wallace was alleged to have said that no one alive could produce a copy of, and which has indeed stood up to this boast. This picture was produced under the strictest test conditions before witnesses.

According to Major Patterson the required test conditions safeguard against all known forms of trickery, and this can include:

1. The use of a trick dark slide.
2. The substitution of slide, plate or film.
3. A double exposure.
4. A film leaving an image, which is placed in the lens.
5. A transparency, which is hidden or introduced into slide or camera.
6. An image which is painted in luminous or radioactive, substance on the inside of slide or concealed in hand and held over the plate, flushed on by a small electric magic lantern arrangement or by an electric printing frame concealed in the hand.
7. A prepared background.
8. Image introduced by pinhole lens, through front or side of camera.
9. Double printing from two different negatives.

Many "spirit extras" have been produced under test conditions by several people. How does one explain these phenomena? The experiments of Dr. Glen Hamilton and his whole

group and all similar groups can be attributed to fraud, but with great difficulty, and sometimes without being able to postulate the fraudulent method. Similarly, one can completely ignore claims such as those of Dr. Laubscher that, “the factual evidence that spirit extras do occur is overwhelming, only utter ignorance of the subject can still account for deliberate denial of its possibility, and postulate fraud for all ‘spirit extras.’ occurring in ordinary photographs, even those under test conditions before witnesses.”

If one does accept that these phenomena occur, however, it does not follow that human survival after bodily death is proven, for an alternative explanation could be the photographing of “thought forms.” This hypothesis may sound farfetched, but is supported by reports like those in Dr. Eisenbud's book, *The World of Serios*, in which, even though fraud was utterly impossible, Serios produced pictures of buildings and statues of different places in the world just by pointing a Polaroid camera at himself!

### **Content of Communications or Phenomena**

The actual contents of communications or of phenomena produced by the alleged “dead” become very significant indeed when alternative explanations for the contents are lacking, or considered scientifically even more improbable than the hypothesis that the human personality survives bodily death.

A little reflection will illustrate the great difficulty of finding such evidential phenomena. The communication must be such that no living person must have the ability to reproduce it under the conditions in which it was produced, but it must nevertheless be recognizable to the degree that it must withstand critical scientific analysis.

Three examples are presented:

1. The Rosemary Records
2. The Cross Correspondences
3. Unfinished Symphonies

#### **The Rosemary Records (11;55,56)**

The Rosemary Records consist of a series of communications partly in Ancient Egyptian alone, partly in English alone, and partly in Ancient Egyptian with English translations. The communications began in 1928 but really were received in bulk from 1931 onwards. The medium involved was a schoolteacher in Blackpool. She worked under the pseudonym “Rosemary,” her real name, Miss Ivy B. being available to serious scholars. The alleged communicator at first called herself “Nona” for she claimed that revealing her true identity immediately may prejudice the acceptance of her communications. Later, she claimed her name was Talikha Ventui, and that during life she was the wife of Pharaoh Amenhotep 111 who lived more than 3300 years ago. In so revealing herself she alleged that her name had been struck from the history records, a practice which she said was common, after an argument, which challenged the existing political and religious attitudes. She prophesies that her existence will be proven some time in the future when the real name of Nona will be found in the tomb of Rama. Nona allegedly communicated through Rosemary both by automatic writing and by speech. Rosemary's “utterings” were taken down phonetically by Dr. Frederic H. Wood, a professor of Music in Blackpool. These utterings were mainly deciphered by A.J. Howard Hulme, an English Egyptologist who lived in Brighton. Hulme was one of the few of the approximately dozen Egyptologists in the world at that time who took an interest in this case.

By 1961, by this means, the Rosemary Records had been subjected to 4912 language tests each carefully referenced to Budge's dictionary or Gardiner's grammar. Once an apparent anachronism was found, until it was realized that the spoken word slightly preceded the written word and indeed, if therefore, no such anachronisms would have been found, the evidential value of the scripts would have been diminished. Moreover, this helped to date the scripts to 3,300 years ago. In addition, vocabularies were occasionally found in the communications, which were either as yet undiscovered or used in a different context. An example are the words "zeet" and "seet," pronounced in Ancient Egyptian in almost the same way, and previously thought to only mean "woman" and now known to mean "yes" and "woman" respectively. It is also interesting to note that 8 of Nona's English phrases, a language she purportedly learnt after death, were phrased in Egyptian syntax. These analyses and stringent language tests have only served to enhance the claim that these are actual communications in the language of the Old Egyptian XVIIIth Dynasty.

A telepathic explanation for these communications e.g., from a distant subconscious "thought form" of one of the living Egyptologists—it hardly needs mentioning that neither Wood nor Rosemary knew any Ancient Egyptian is impossible. Hulme explains why: "No one on earth understands an Egyptian message immediately it comes through a 'psychic' receiver, nor do I as translator know what it means until I have studied it, thrown out all other preliminary 'possibles,' and finally subjected it to a rigorous test as to its grammatical construction. It may be added that the Xenoglossy involved in these communications is at its most evidential being in all three of the possible classes i.e., relative (which relates to the context), responsive and bilingual."

The possibility of these communications being merely retrocognitive, involving "past figment" being attached to the present, is ruled out by responsive xenoglossia. For example, Hulme spent 20 hours setting a series of 12 questions in Ancient Egyptian. These were put phonetically to Nona by Hulme himself and were answered immediately and spontaneously and at great length by Nona in 66 phrases. The time taken to answer, which includes the reading of the set questions, was 90 minutes. It would have taken an Egyptologist 110 hours to have answered in the same way.

The possibility of Nona being a subliminal personality of Rosemary can be ruled out by the spontaneity and independence of thought of the communications which were spoken at a rate of normal speech about a hundredth the time it would take Egyptologists to speak it and with absolute sureness of the Egyptian. However, even if it were shown that Nona were a subliminal personality of Rosemary's this would not detract from these communications being evidential of the survival of the human personality after bodily death.

The hypothesis of these communications being a giant fraud involving Hulme, Wood and Rosemary, is ruled out because this appears to be impossible to commit. In addition a double-sided gramophone record containing 35 Egyptian phrases was made before the International Institute of Psychical Research under the supervision of the then Research Officer, Dr. Nandor Fodor, on the 4th May 1936.

Two further references to the Rosemary Records should be made. The first concerns the wealth of historical information pertaining to the Old Egyptian XVIIIth Dynasty it contains. This, as far as I know, does not conflict with any known aspects of the history of this time but does contain much further additional information. For example, it contains a reference to "electricity harnessed from the air" received on 5th August, 1936. This reference parallels that received by a completely different psychic source allegedly from the explorer, Colonel Fawcett, on 5th December 1935, but which was not published until 20 years later (1). (The medium Geraldine Cummins received this by automatic writing.) The second relates to the

accusations of fraud by Professor Gunn of Oxford. These were answered on 14th July 1938 By Nona in forceful Egyptian in a demonstration before the Society for Psychical Research which Nona herself had demanded!

The Rosemary Records has been cited as proof of the hypothesis of extended survival after bodily death. According to Andreas and Adams the Rosemary Records must, in addition, “be considered the most outstanding case of psychical discovery known to this day.”

### **The Cross-Correspondences (1,38,51)**

Between 1906 and 1936 a series of messages with no proper beginnings or endings and which made little or no sense in themselves, but which related to the same subjects and were complementary to or supplied clues to each other, were received by automatic writing from about eight independent mediumistic sources. These messages have come to be known as “The Cross Correspondences.”

G.N.M. Tyrrell, a former President of the British Society for Psychical Research, describes the process thus: Something was selecting and distributing among the automatists, elements of a single pattern, so that the scripts formed kind of a literary jigsaw. To discover what was going on required a high degree of literary and classical knowledge as well as ingenuity.

The messages were signed with the names of deceased former founders and members of the Society of Psychical research, principally F.W.H. Myers, poet and classical scholar, who died in 1901, Edmund Gurney, who died in 1888, the distinguished Cambridge scholar Professor Henry Sidgwick, who died in 1900. Later, they were joined by Professor A.W. Verall and Professor Henry Butcher.

The “communicators” explained that a single theme distributed between various automatists, none of whom knew what the others were writing, would prove that a single independent mind, or a group of minds was at the back of the whole 4t~phenomenon. Thus, this joint experimental work, whose initiative allegedly came from the other side, and whose overall detail was entirely unknown to living persons, could not easily be explained by either cross telepathy, clairvoyance, or by the workings of a secondary or subliminal personality. Also, recondite points in classical literature (in Greek and Latin; English, of course, was the main language of communication) were introduced to prove the identity of the authors. (Myers, Verall and Butcher had all been front rank classical scholars.) One of the better known of these cross-correspondences is the “Ear of Dionysius,” a classical and literary puzzle, whose very complexity precludes description. The mediums involved in the Cross Correspondences were: Dame Edith Lyttleton, who was President of the British SPR in 1933-1934, and who used the pseudonym “Mrs. King,” until 1923; Mrs. A.W. Verall, a lecturer in classics at Newham College, Cambridge; and her daughter, Helen. Involved later were Mrs. W.A. Salter, Alice Kipling (Rudyard's sister), whose pseudonym was Mrs. Holland and who received some of her scripts in India; (9). Additionally, there were Mrs. Leonore Piper, the American medium whose mediumistic abilities had been confirmed by Dr. Richard Hodgson and Sir Oliver Lodge independently; the Mackinnon family of Aberdeen; and 'Mrs. Willett' whose true identity was revealed only when the medium Miss Geraldine Cummins received 40 automatic scripts from her starting a year after Mrs. Willett's death in 1956, and whose true name the SPR then released as Mrs. Winifred Coombe Tennant, magistrate and first female British delegate to the League of Nations. The Cross-Correspondences contain many precognitive allusions mainly relating to the First World War. These included: the sinking of the Lusitania on 7th May 1915; and the bombing of Fenchurch Street, London in 191. There were later times precognitive allusions such as: the Munich Bond signed on 30th September 1933; the Berchtesgaten (Hitler's home); and even an instrument, which has great force, and is manipulated from far away. It was called “the pencil of light” (Mrs. Richmond,

10 p.m. 2<sup>nd</sup> March 1932)—a possible reference to the laser.

The Cross-Correspondences were assessed mainly by the Second Earl of Balfour, politician; Sir Oliver Lodge, physicist; and J.C. Piddington. Over 3,000 documents were considered, many of which are unpublished. Piddington pointed out that nothing to his mind was “more remarkable in the scripts of the automatists than the persistency with which obscure and embryonic allusions are followed up, modified and added to, the wrong points eliminated and the right ones emphasized until at long last the topic originally aimed at but at first imperfectly represented emerges in a clear and unmistakable form. This process may extend over many years and is evidence of amazing patience and perseverance on somebody's part.” The Cross Correspondences are, in the opinion of some eminent psychical researchers who studied them for years, the most convincing evidence of intelligent communication from the “dead.”

### **Unfinished Symphonies (10,21)**

Musical composition is one of the few spheres in which the alleged communications from the dead can be quantitatively assessed to some degree both in terms of its standard and its style. Musical composition requires, moreover, not only creative genius but also a thorough musical background. In addition, compositions usually are time consuming and composers tend to develop particular styles.

Between March 1964 and 1970, the medium Rosemary Brown produced some 400 pieces of music—songs, piano pieces, some incomplete string quartets, the beginning of an opera as well as partly completed concertos and symphonies. She claimed that this music has been communicated to her by dead musical composers. Her main communicator was, allegedly, Franz Liszt, whose composition “Grubelei” is probably her most well known work. Other communicators whose works she claims to have received are Chopin, Schubert, Beethoven, Bach, Brahms, Schumann, Debussy, Grieg, Berlioz, Rachmaninov and Monteverdi. Albert Schweitzer and Mozart have also given her compositions she claimed.

Sir Donald Tovey, musician and composer, who died in 1940, has been quoted as “saying” (through the medium of Rosemary) that “in communicating through music and conversation, an organized group of musicians who have departed from your world are attempting to establish a precept for humanity i.e. that physical death is a transition from one state of consciousness to another wherein one retains one's individuality.”

How do these claims stand up to critical analysis? Referring to Rosemary Brown, Sir George Trevelyan has pointed out that she had no musical background or initial talent, almost no training, and very little experience in listening to records or concerts whether live or on the radio. These facts can, fortunately, be easily affirmed because Rosemary Brown has lived in the same house in Tooting Bec Common all her life and friends, neighbors and her family doctor have confirmed her comparatively humble circumstances. Professor Tenhaeff, Professor of Parapsychology at Utrecht University, had tested Mrs. Brown and found her “quite normal.”

Mrs. Brown's alleged compositions and conversations have been constantly investigated: Professor of Music, Ian Parrott, stated, “everything she has produced is stylistically possible.” Composer, Richard Rodney Bennett, emphasized that “you couldn't fake music like this without years of training. I couldn't have faked some of the Beethoven myself. While not proven, communication with the dead is highly suggestive in the case of Rosemary Brown's 'Unfinished Symphonies.' ”

## Conclusions

To discuss the specific when there are tens of thousands, if not hundreds of thousands, of examples to be cited, is almost like discussing the evidential value of a single rand note in proving the existence of the South African mint. But if that rand note can serve to prove the existence of the South African mint, it has served its purpose. As such these examples serve only to strengthen the overall position by their excellent value per se, but if refuted do not disprove human survival after bodily death.

Indeed, the occurrence of extrasensory phenomena is such that if fraudulent experimentation is the answer to the positive evidence for ESP, it implies that there is “a gigantic conspiracy involving some thirty University departments all over the world and several hundred respectable scientists in various fields.” (Professor H.J. Eysenck, 1959) Even more common is the instinctive feeling that immortality is true. “This is one of the deepest proofs that it is.” (Norman Vincent Peale)

The following conclusions may be drawn from the preceding pages:

1. that death as an extinction is an illusory concept;
2. that individual human entities survive physical death;
3. that these individuals retain at least some knowledge of their physical experiences;
4. that these individuals can continue to learn after physical death;
5. that laws are apparent which contradict or which occur outside the range of our physical laws of space, time and even mass;
6. that the “dead” have communicated with the living.

If one further applies the premise that if the basic pattern of human fate is the same, and that if one person survives bodily death, everyone does, the conclusion is apparently almost inescapable that the human personality survives bodily death.

Let me show in allegory how far our nature is enlightened or unenlightened. “*The truth may be nothing but the shadows of images. If told this were an illusion, would Man not fancy that shadows he formerly saw were truer than the objects now shown to him? He will take refuge in the shadows which are clearer to him than the truth.*” Plato (condensed). Is not possible that the shadow Man sees is his physical reality alone?

## Bibliography

1. Andreas, P. and Adams, G. (1967) *Between Heaven and Earth*. Harrap, London.
2. Archer, F. (1969) *Ghost Detective*. Allen, London.
3. Archer, F. (1966) *Ghost Writer*. Allen, London.
4. Ash, M. (1962) *Health, Radiation and Healing*. Mackay, Philadelphia.
5. Barbannel, M. (1965) *He Walks In Two Worlds*. Jenkins, London.
6. Barbannel, M. (1969) *Spiritualism Today*. Jenkins London.
7. Blythe, P. (1971) *Hypnotism: Its Power and Practice*. Barker, London.

8. Bridge, A. (1971) *Moments of Knowing*. Hodder and Son, London.
9. Broad, C.D. (1968) Introduction to '*Frontiers Of The Unknown*'. A. McKenzie, Barker, London.
10. Brown, R. (1971) *Unfinished Symphonies*. Souvenir London.
11. Chaplin, J.P. (1960) *The Unconscious*. Ballantine, New York.
12. Christopher, M. (1971) *Seers, Psychics and ESP*. Cassell, London.
13. Cornell, R. and Cummins, G. (1971) *Healing the Mind*. Aquarian Press, London.
14. Diamond, E. (1962) *The Science of Dreams*. Eyre and Spotteswoode, London.
15. Dixon, J. (1971) *My Life and Prophecies*. Muller, London.
16. Edwards, H. (1960) *Spirit Healing*. Jenkins, London.
17. Edwards, H. (1965) *The Healing Intelligence*. Jenkins, London.
18. Edwards, H. (1968) *Thirty Years as a Spiritual Healer*. Jenkins, London.
19. Edwards, H. (1953) *The Evidence for Spirit Healing*. Spiritualist Press. London.
20. Findlay, A. (1932) *On the Edge of the Etheric Rider*, London.
21. Flint, L. (1971) *Voices In The Dark — My Life As A Medium*. Macmillan, London.
22. Griffith, J.S. (1967) *A View of the Brain*. Clarendon Press, Oxford.
23. Hall, T.H. (1965) *New Light on Old Ghosts*. Duckworth, London.
24. Heywood, R. (1964) *The Infinite Hive*. Chatto and Windus, London.
25. Holzer, H. (1970) *Window to the Past*. Frewin, London.
- 25a. Holzer, H. (1971) *Life after Death*. Sidgwick and Co, London.
26. Hurkos, P. (1961) *Psychic* Popular Library, NY.
27. Hutton, J.B. (1966) *Healing Hands*. Allen, London.
28. Hutton, J.B. (1964) *Out of This World*. Psychic Press, London.
29. Inglis, B. (1964) *Fringe Medicine*. Faber and Faber, London.
30. Kline, M. (1960) *Mathematics and the Physical World*. John Murray, London.
31. Koestler, A. (1959) *The Sleepwalkers* Hutchinson, London.
32. Laubscher, J.B.F. (1967) *Beyond Life's Curtain*, Timmins, Cape Town.
33. Laubscher, J.B.F. (1963) *Where Mystery Dwells*. Timmins, Cape Town.
34. Lethbridge, T.C. (1965) *ESP: Beyond Time and Distance*. Routledge and Kegan Paul,

London.

35. Lethbridge, T.C. (1967) *A Step In The Dark*. Routledge and Kegan Paul, London.
36. Ling, F.R. (N.D.) *The Unbroken Link*. Regency Press, London.
37. Maby, J.C. and Franklin, T.B. (1939) *The Physics Of The Divining Rod*. George Bell and Sons Ltd., London.
38. McKenzie, A. (1962) *Frontiers Of The Unknown*. Barker, London.
39. Montgomery, R. (1966) *A Gift of Prophecy*. Barker, London.
40. Nichols, B. (1966) *Powers That Be*. Cape, London.
41. Norman, R. (1958) *Mike*. Natal Press, Pietermaritzburg.
42. Ostrander and Schroder (1972) *Psychic Discoveries Behind the Iron Curtain*. Prentice Hall, New Jersey.
43. Penrose, E. (1952) *Adventure Unlimited*. Neville Spearman, London.
44. Pike, J.A. (1969) *The Other Side*. Allen, London.
45. Pole, W.T. (1965) *Private Dowding*. Neville Spearman, London.
46. Rhine, J.B. (1935) *Extra Sensory Perception*. Faber and Faber, London.
47. Rhine, J.B. (1948) *The Reach of the Mind*. Faber and Faber. London.
48. Rhine, J.B. (1954) *New World of the Mind*. Faber and Faber, London.
49. Sherman, H. (1965) *How to Make ESP Work for You*. Muller, London.
50. Sherman, H. and Bristol, C.M. (1961) *TNT — the Power Within You*. Prentice Hall, London.
51. Tyrrell, G.M. (1947) *The Personality of Man*. Penguin, London.
52. Vassiliev, L.L. (1965) *Experiments in Mental Suggestion*. ISMI.
53. Wentworth, J.D. (1969) *In Search of Ghosts*. Muller, London.
54. Whiteman, J.H.M. (1961) *The Mystical Life*. Faber and Faber, London.
55. Wood, F.H. (1939) *This Egyptian Miracle* Mackay, Philadelphia.
56. Wood, F.H. and Hulme, A.J.H. (1937) *Ancient Egypt Speaks*. Rider, London.
57. Richards, J. The Church's Ministry of Healing (1958) *The Archbishop's Commission*. Redhill, Surrey.
58. Muldoon, S. and Carrington, H. (Circa 1938) *The Projection of the Astral Body* Samuel Weiser, New York.
59. Broad, C.D. (1967) *The Notion of Precognition*. Routledge and Kegan Paul, London.

60. Mundy-Castle, A.C. (14 May.1952) "The Neurophysiological and Philosophical Implications of Parapsychology." Paper to SASPR.
61. Nelson, G.K. (11.11.1962) "Psychological and Parapsychological Significance of Brain Waves." Paper presented to 107th meeting SASPR.
62. Nelson, G.K. (July, 1970) "Some Behavioural Anomalies Associated with Temporal Lobe Dysfunction." Paper presented at 22nd annual congress of the SA Psychological Association.
63. Nelson, G.K. 1970) "Preliminary Study of Electroencephalograms of Mediums." *Parapsychologica IV*. No.9: 30-35.
64. Nelson, G.K. (1971) "A Neuropsychological Study of the Children of the Knysna Forest Workers." *Psychologia Africana* 12: 143171.
65. Poynton, J.C. (1970) "Nonphysical Experience and Parapsychology'." Address delivered at 1st AGM S.A. Institute for Parapsychological Research.
66. Price, E.A. (1970) "Two apparently reciprocal Telepathic Dreams and Suggestions for a New Approach to the Study of Spontaneous Cases." *Parapsychologica IV*. No. 9 SASPR.
67. Purpura, D.P. (1956) "Electrophysiological analysis of psychogenic drug action." *Arch. Neuro J. Psychiat.* 75, 132143.
68. Whiteman, J.H. (July 5th 1972) "Out of Body Experience and the group mind." Lecture to Society for Psychical Research, London.
69. Nelson, G.K. (July, August, 1972) Personal verbal communications.
70. Walter W.G. (17th July 1972) Personal written communication.
71. Whiteman, J.H.M. (20th July, 1972; 2nd August, 1972) Personal written communications.

Reprint requests to:

Vernon M. Neppe, MD, PhD

e-mail: [brain@pni.org](mailto:brain@pni.org)